

From: [Jaime Jahncke](#)
To: [McChesney, Gerry](#); [Russell Bradley](#)
Cc: [Keller, Kaylene](#); [Nadav Nur](#); [Ryan Berger](#)
Subject: RE: Final draft report on Farallon Sally Spatial Analysis
Date: Friday, December 9, 2016 6:25:45 PM
Importance: High

Hi Gerry

Thank you for the feedback...

We will address and send final version.

Jamie and Bret will be co-authors on the paper, that is why the section was written that way.

Thank you,

Jaime Jahncke, Ph.D., *California Current Director*
707-781-2555 ext.335 | 707-338-1609 (cell)

Point Blue — *Conservation science for a healthy planet.*

From: McChesney, Gerry [mailto:gerry_mcchesney@fws.gov]
Sent: Friday, December 09, 2016 1:49 PM
To: Russell Bradley <rbradley@pointblue.org>
Cc: Keller, Kaylene (kaylene_keller@fws.gov) <kaylene_keller@fws.gov>; Nadav Nur <nnur@pointblue.org>; Ryan Berger <rberger@pointblue.org>; Jaime Jahncke <jjahncke@pointblue.org>
Subject: Re: Final draft report on Farallon Sally Spatial Analysis

All:

Attached are my comments on the draft report. Apologies for taking this long.

The information provided in the report goes provides a great deal of new information on Farallon salamanders and will be very useful in advising future monitoring, conservation and management of this species and island habitats. I know a huge amount of effort has been put into this and I thank you all for that. It's great to have some quantitative estimates that describe their distribution and abundance and to give us a broader perspective. The map is really great. I marked up the document with my edits and comments, but some of my more important comments are listed here:

- 1) Much of the Methods are written more for an "in the know" audience and was a bit hard to follow. I made several suggested edits to try to make the document more readable and understandable for those not familiar with this study.
- 2) Vegetation (cover) Mapping Data Collection (Methods section) - Description of data collection makes it sound like you conducted this, possibly as part of this study. Need to be very clear who that study was conducted by (B. Holzman, SJSU) and that you are using data provided. Need to give credit where it is needed.
- 3) Instead of calling it "vegetation type" call it "cover type" because not all is vegetation.
- 4) Combining buildings, planted trees and bare soil as a cover type seems like an odd combination but not sure what to do about that now. Perhaps more description of your reasons for combining them would be helpful.
- 5) Too much present tense. Descriptions of data collection and results should be most past tense.

- 6) States data for population estimate was from Feb. 2016 but not explained why that month and year was chosen.
- 7) From the graph, looks like March salamander activity was almost the same as February. Could Feb and Mar data been combined for use in analyses? Curious as to whether it may have made analyses more robust or more limiting?
- 8) For arthropods, maximum counts were used instead of something like the mean. Please provide explanation of reasoning.
- 9) I was somewhat surprised that soil moisture was even included in the models given the difficulties with data collection, and even more surprised that some explanation of issues with data quality were not addressed. Some information needs to be added on issues with the measurements (high variability, low soil depth, etc.) and caveats of the model because of that, with even an indication of why that data should be trusted. For recommendations, do you have any for improving soil moisture measurements in the future?
- 10) You refer to the portions of the island not included in analyses as "intertidal". This is not entirely correct and this area does include a fairly high amount of upland, including parts of Shubrick Pt., Fert Flat, Corm Blind Hill, and Falcon's Roost. For vegetation sampling, Holzman refers to these areas as "edge" and include intertidal and other areas laid bare by pinnipeds, murres and are difficult to access. Should explain why they were not included. I assume it's because Jamie Hawk did not characterize cover types in them?
- On Fri, Oct 7, 2016 at 4:22 PM, Russell Bradley <rbradley@pointblue.org> wrote:

Hi Kaylene,

Please find attached the final draft report for our salamander spatial analysis. Big thanks go to Ryan for leading this effort, with major contributions from Jaime and Nadav as well. We are excited with the results and look forward to your review. As per your suggestion to Jaime when you were at our offices this week we would be happy to discuss this (along with our power analysis report we submitted earlier this summer) on a conference call in just over 2 weeks. During the week of October 24th, looking at our schedules, Monday afternoon, anytime Tuesday, Friday Morning, or Monday morning the 31st the following week would work best for us. Please let us know if one of those times would work for you – hopefully Gerry can attend as well.

Thanks for your support of this project

Russ

Russell Bradley, MSc, *Farallon Program Leader*
Point Blue Conservation Science
3820 Cypress Drive, Suite 11, Petaluma, CA 94954
707-781-2555 ext.314
Fax: 707-765-1685
www.pointblue.org | Follow Point Blue on [Facebook](#)!
Point Blue—*Conservation science for a healthy planet.*

--

Gerry

Gerry McChesney
Manager, Farallon National Wildlife Refuge and
Common Murre Restoration Project

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
San Francisco Bay National Wildlife Refuge Complex
1 Marshlands Road
Fremont, CA 94555
Phone: 510-792-0222, ext. 222, cell: 510-435-9151
Email: Gerry_McChesney@fws.gov
<http://www.fws.gov/refuge/farallon/>
<http://www.fws.gov/sfbayrefuges/murre/murrehome.htm>
[Follow us on Facebook!](#)
